CVSI

Tracking Chinese Vulnerability in Real Time Using Big Data

Carlos Casanova / Alvaro Ortiz / Tomasa Rodrigo / Le Xia

The China Vulnerability Sentiment Index (CVSI): Tracking risk in real time

In a recent working Paper (Shiller, R. 2017),1 the Nobel Prize winner Robert Shiller claimed that the use of new empirical research through textual analysis and Big Data should be extended empirically to analyze the role of narratives in Business Cycle Theory. In this watch and forthcoming paper, we take this into account to analyze Chinese vulnerability. Moreover, rather than focusing on measuring economic activity sentiment related indicators (i.e. animal spirits); we develop an index to track Chinese vulnerability sentiment in real time using Big Data. This could help us to identify key vulnerabilities in China using risk narratives, which have the potential to become self-fulfilling in either direction.

Figure 1

Chinese Vulnerability Sentiment Index (CVSI) combining key indicators with big data
Evolution of the “tone” of the main themes on vulnerability in China. Higher values indicate an improvement in sentiment and lower vulnerability

Source: CEIC, Bloomberg, Wind, www.gdelt.org and BBVA Research

Our new China Vulnerability Sentiment Index (CVSI) combines daily time series on sentiment from a Big Data database called Global Database on Events Location and Tone (GDELT) with official statistics (hard data) and financial indicators, making it unique in its robustness and depth (Figure 1). GDELT2 is an initiative which aims to construct “a catalogue of human societal-scale behavior and beliefs across all countries”

2 Further information can be found in the paper Leetaru, K. and Schrodt, P., 2013. Global Database of Events, Language, and Tone (GDELT) and in the following link.
through the continuous analysis of news and events referenced in the media. Thanks to the use of high frequency Big Data series from GDELT, the CVSI enables us to “nowcast” vulnerability developments and identify early warning signals in real time, helping investors and policy makers to factor in risks ahead of time. Our index is unique in the sense that it enables us to track vulnerability and sentiment along a number of risk parameters. These were carefully selected to replicate the main vulnerabilities faced by the Chinese economy, as reflected by the four main components of the CVSI, outlined in more detail below.

Tracking vulnerability along four main components: Data and methodology

The index is composed by four different vulnerability dimensions:

1. **The stated owned enterprises (SOE) vulnerability component**, which captures indebtedness concerns among highly leveraged state owned enterprises.
2. **The housing bubble vulnerability component**, taking into account risks of a potential correction in the housing market bubble.
3. **The shadow banking vulnerability component**, measuring the fast expansion of shadow banking activities, leading to an overall deterioration of credit conditions.
4. **The exchange rate (FX) speculative pressure component**, which accounts for speculative pressures in the exchange rate market.

These dimensions, or components, were selected to reflect vulnerability developments on the ground in China, making this a highly specific and targeted indicator. Each component combines hard data in mixed frequencies – including daily, weekly, monthly and quarterly series – with high frequency indicators from GDELT (Figure 2). The variables included in each component were selected using a Bayesian Model averaging approach. Moreover, the components can be further disaggregated to offer a more granular vision of what drives vulnerability sentiment in China, offering a more nuanced view on policymaking.

To construct the high frequency indicators from GDELT, we exploit sentiment analysis from the media. Rather than relying on the concentration of news to develop sentiment indicators (as in Baker, Bloom & Davis, 2015), one of the advantages of GDELT is that it allows us to use sentiment analysis to extract information about the qualitative direction of the vulnerability in China (negative, neutral or positive). Like other recent papers (Shapiro, A Sudhof M and Wilson D., 2017), we opted for a hybrid strategy to extract sentiment about vulnerability by using deep learning models and lexicon strategies. This is advantageous because it enables us to obtain qualitative as well as quantitative attributes, something which is not possible with other textual analysis techniques.

---

3 Bayesian model averaging offers a systematic method for analyzing specification uncertainty and checking the robustness of one’s results to alternative model specifications. Using Bayesian techniques the BMA calculate the Posterior Inclusion Probability on any independent variable to explain a dependent one.


5 The use of sentiment analysis has been widely used in Social Sciences. The use of Natural Language Processing (NLP) techniques allows for the quantitative analysis of the sentiment included in unstructured data by using Deep Learning Algorithms and/or in combination with sentiment referenced Lexicon strategies.

To synthetize this large multidimensional dataset, with different variables and dimensions, into a single index, we used principal component analysis (PCA)\(^7\). PCA is a multivariate technique that enables us to reduce complex datasets to a lower dimension, revealing the most relevant underlying trends by examining the variances associated to the principal components. The results of the CVSI are shown in Figure 1, where the SOE component weighs 29% of the total index, the housing bubble vulnerability component 26%, the shadow banking vulnerability component 23% and the FX speculative pressure component 22%, according to this methodology\(^8\).

### Improvement in sentiment and lower vulnerability since 2H16

The CVSI shows an improvement in vulnerability and sentiment since 2H16. This improvement is in stark contrast to the sharp decline which followed from a series of policy missteps in 2015-2016. As can be seen in Figure 1, our index does a good job at capturing the deterioration in sentiment and an increase in vulnerability following from two stock market crashes and an ill-timed devaluation of the RMB, which ultimately resulted in a third of the value of the Shanghai Stock Exchange being wiped out in what is now referred to as “Black Monday”. Together with burgeoning levels of corporate debt – the bulk of which has been accrued by SOEs – and expectations of Yuan devaluation, fears of a potential collapse of the Chinese economy and its implications on the global financial system led to a steep deterioration of the sentiment and

\(^7\) Further information about the methodology will be found in the forthcoming paper.

\(^8\) Results are robust and there are no significant differences compared to an index with equally weighted components.
an increase in vulnerabilities throughout 2016 and 1H16. Nevertheless, we see an inflexion point nearing 2H16, coinciding with the conclusion of the NPC meeting. After this, authorities made clear their commitment to growth targets but without forgetting reforms, adjusting the policy mix to more fiscal support combined with a tighter monetary policy stance and a stricter macro-prudential framework. The improvement in the CVSI after the change in the policy mix can be traced back to three of the components of the CVSI (Figure 3).

Our SOE component has edged up since the announcement of reforms aimed at curbing overcapacity in the bloated steel and cement sectors, while simultaneously seeking to boost productivity through closures and M&As. As a note of caution, overall indebtedness remains very high at approximately 270% of GDP, so we would expect to see some more volatility in this component going forward. Shadow banking activities have come under scrutiny recently, with the China Banking Regulation Commission (CBRC) launching a new crackdown on shadow banking activities around September 2016. On the Housing front, our component has been edging up based on two seemingly contradictory factors. On the one hand, housing prices have continued to increase. On the other, a number of curbs on property prices have tamed bubbles in first-tier cities such as Shanghai and Shenzhen. This reflects the fact that Chinese authorities have allowed prices to increase in order to support GDP, but have also maneuvered to contain asset price risks in major cities.

The only component where we do not observe an improvement is FX speculative pressures. This is due to the fact that, particularly during 4Q16, the RMB saw significant depreciatory pressures, leading to outflows and a depletion of FX reserves below the watershed level of 3 trillion USD. Much of this pressure has abated in 1Q17, on the back of a weaker USD and a recovery in global trade.
The CVSI performs well and offers insights into the optimum policy mix

In addition to acting as a gauge of sentiment and vulnerability in China, empirical results show that the CVSI, can be used to nowcast (as a leading indicator) Chinese risk premiums. As shown in Figure 4, there is a very high correlation between the CVSI and the Sovereign Credit Default Swap (CDS). In other words, worsening sentiment or risk narratives on vulnerabilities will be reflected on risk premiums. Although not designed as a tool to forecast economic activity, the CVSI also has predictive potential for other indicators of economic activity, as proxied by the Purchasing Manager’s Index (PMI). The PMI is an indicator of the economic health of the manufacturing sector, and is based on a monthly survey conducted to large enterprises. An improvement in sentiment and vulnerability translates into higher PMIs and vice-versa (Figure 5), as manager’s responses are partially influenced by their perception of the state of the economy. Beyond this, the CVSI has the additional advantage that it can be updated on a quasi-real-time basis, whereas PMIs are published monthly.

Moreover, the CVSI can also be deployed to evaluate the effectiveness of the current monetary and fiscal policy responses. According to our real time Monetary and Fiscal Policy Pulses⁹, where we also combine big data series with hard data. Fiscal policy has been expansionary and is positively correlated with an improvement in the CVSI. On the other hand, monetary policy has been contractionary and is inversely related to an improvement in the CVSI (Figures 6 and 7). In other words, the adequate policy mix to cope with vulnerability should include a tighter monetary policy with further fiscal support. On a more granular level, both expansionary monetary and fiscal policies will reduce vulnerabilities for the SOE component, generating positive conditions for growth while simultaneously providing a favorable environment for repayment and

---

⁹ Monetary Policy Pulse includes hard data (RRR, 1Y best lending rate, 3M SHIBOR and M2) as well as data from GDELT (monetary_policy, monetary_and_financial_stability, econ_centralbank, econ_interest_rates, econ_inflation and macroprudential_policy). The Fiscal Policy Pulse Index includes hard data (Government surplus or deficit and a subcomponent of the Shanghai Composite Index focusing on infrastructure) as well as data from GDELT (fiscal_policy, econ_taxation and fiscal_balance).
rollover of existing debt. This is similar in the case of housing, as lower borrowing costs should help to stimulate demand and also alleviate the burden on leveraged financing. Expansionary fiscal policy contributes marginally to an improvement in the shadow banking component, while looser monetary policy has, as expected, detrimental effects on vulnerability and sentiment. Finally, expansionary monetary and fiscal policies add to existing pressures on the FX component as they would exert further depreciatory pressure on the RMB, risking steeper capital outflows and a depletion of FX reserves.

Summary

The CVSI enables us to track vulnerability sentiment in China in real time by using Big Data techniques. Sentiment analysis has been deployed in previous studies focusing on the evolution of housing prices, while textual search is a burgeoning field in economic research (Shiller, 2014). Our research and a forthcoming paper pretend to contribute to the advancement of this field. The fact that the index combines both Big Data indicators in high frequency with hard data means that we can accurately and comprehensively analyze the narrative of Chinese vulnerabilities in real time, offering valuable insights for investors and policymakers alike.

The index has improved since 2H16, in line with a pick-up in economic activity but also with a change in the policy mix by Chinese authorities. The “risk narrative” looks to be improving for the Chinese economy, but it may still be too soon to determine if this mood can be self-fulfilling. Of particular interest will be monitoring the development of vulnerability and sentiment in the months to come. In addition, authorities should continue to tweak their policy response in line with our view in order to sustain growth while simultaneously limiting vulnerabilities along the main risk parameters.
IMPORTANT DISCLOSURES

The BBVA Group companies that have participated in preparing or contributed information, opinions, estimates, forecasts or recommendations to this report are identified by the location(s) of the author(s) listed on the first page as follows: 1) Madrid, London or Europe = Banco Bilbao Vizcaya Argentaria, S.A., including its E.U. branches (hereinafter called ‘BBVA’); 2) Mexico City = BBVA Bancomer, S.A. Institución de Banca Múltiple, Grupo Financiero BBVA Bancomer (hereinafter called ‘BBVA Bancomer’); 3) New York = BBVA Securities, Inc. (hereinafter called “BBVA Securities”); 4) New York Branch = BBVA, New York branch; 5) Lima = BBVA Continental; 6) Bogota = BBVA Colombia S.A.; 7) Santiago = BBVA Chile S.A.; 8) Hong Kong = BBVA, Hong Kong branch; 9.) Istanbul = Garanti Securities.

For recipients in the European Union, this document is distributed by BBVA, a bank supervised by the Bank of Spain and by Spain’s Stock Exchange Commission (CNMV), and registered with the Bank of Spain with number 0182.

For recipients in Hong Kong, this document is distributed by BBVA, which Hong Kong branch is supervised by the Hong Kong Monetary Authority.

For recipients in Mexico, this document is distributed by BBVA Bancomer, a bank supervised by the Comisión Nacional Bancaria y de Valores de México.

For recipients in Peru, this document is distributed by BBVA Continental, a bank supervised by the Superintendencia de Banca, Seguros y Administradoras Privadas de Fondos de Pensiones.

For recipients in Singapore, this document is distributed by BBVA, which Singapore branch is supervised by the Monetary Authority of Singapore.

For recipients in USA, research on products other than swaps, or equity securities and equity derivatives prepared by BBVA, is being distributed by BBVA Securities, a subsidiary of BBVA registered with and supervised by the U.S. Securities and Exchange Commission and a member of the Financial Industry Regulatory Authority (“FINRA”) and the Securities Investor Protection Corporation. U.S. persons wishing to execute any transactions should do so only by contacting a representative of BBVA Securities in the U.S. Unless local regulations provide otherwise, non-U.S. persons should contact and execute transactions through a BBVA branch or affiliate in their home jurisdiction.

Research on swaps is being distributed by BBVA, a swaps dealer registered with and supervised by the Commodity Futures Trading Commission (“CFTC”). U.S. persons wishing to execute any transactions should do so only by contacting a representative of BBVA. Unless local regulations provide otherwise, non-U.S. persons should contact and execute transactions through a BBVA branch or affiliate in their home jurisdiction.

Research prepared by BBVA on equity securities and equity derivatives is being distributed by BBVA to “major U.S. institutional investors” based on an exemption from registration provided by Rule 15a-6 of the U.S. Securities Exchange Act of 1934, as amended (the “Exchange Act”). BBVA is subject to a Capital Markets Code of Conduct, which details the standards of the above-mentioned overall policy for the EU. Among other regulations, it includes rules to prevent and avoid conflicts of interests with the ratings given, including information barriers. This Code and the Internal Standards is available for reference in the ‘Corporate Governance’ section of the following web site: www.bbvaresearch.com.

BBVA Bancomer is subject to a Code of Conduct and to Internal Standards of Conduct on the Security Markets, which details the standards of the above-mentioned overall policy for Peru. Among other regulations, it includes rules to prevent and avoid conflicts of interests with the ratings given, including information barriers. This Code and the Internal Standards are available for reference in the ‘Nuevo Banco’ menu of the following web site: https://www.bbvaventures.com/meta/conoce-bbva.

BBVA Securities is subject to a Capital Markets Code of Conduct, which details the standards of the above-mentioned overall policy for USA. Among other regulations, it includes rules to prevent and avoid conflicts of interests with the ratings given, including information barriers.

Exclusively for Recipients Resident in Mexico

BBVA Bancomer acts as a market maker/specialist in: MexDer Future Contracts (US dollar [DEUA], 28-day TIIEs [TE28], TIIE Swaps, 91-day CETES [CE91]), Bonos M, Bonos M3, Bonos M10, BMV Price and Quotations Index (IPC), Options Contracts (IPC, shares in América Móvil, Cemex, CPO, Femsa UBD, Gcarso A1, Telmex L) and Udibonos.

BBVA Bancomer, and, as applicable, its affiliates within BBVA Bancomer Financial Group, may hold from time to time investments in the securities or derivative financial instruments with underlying securities covered in this report, which represent 10% or more of its securities or investment portfolio, or 10% or more of the issue or underlying of the securities covered.
DISCLAIMER

This document and the information, opinions, estimates, forecasts and recommendations expressed herein have been prepared to provide BBVA Group’s customers with general information and are current as of the date hereof and subject to changes without prior notice. Neither BBVA nor any of its affiliates is responsible for giving notice of such changes or for updating the contents hereof.

This document and its contents do not constitute an offer, invitation or solicitation to purchase or subscribe to any securities or other instruments, to undertake or divest investments, or to participate in any trading strategy. Neither shall this document nor its contents form the basis of any contract, commitment or decision of any kind.

Investors who have access to this document should be aware that the securities, instruments or investments to which it refers may not be appropriate for them due to their specific investment goals, financial positions or risk profiles, as these have not been taken into account to prepare this report. Therefore, investors should make their own investment decisions considering the said circumstances and obtaining such specialized advice as may be necessary. Other than the disclosures relating to BBVA Group, the contents of this document are based upon information available to the public that has been obtained from sources considered to be reliable. However, such information has not been independently verified by BBVA or any of its affiliates and therefore no warranty, either express or implied, is given regarding its accuracy, integrity or correctness. To the extent permitted by law, BBVA and its affiliates accept no liability of any type for any direct or indirect losses or damages arising from the use of this document or its contents. Investors should note that the past performance of securities or instruments or the historical results of investments do not guarantee future performance.

The market prices of securities or instruments or the results of investments could fluctuate against the interests of investors. Investors should be aware that they could experience a loss of their investment. Transactions in futures, derivatives, options on securities or high-yield securities can involve high risks and are not appropriate for every investor. Indeed, in the case of some investments, the potential losses may exceed the amount of initial investment and, in such circumstances; investors may be required to pay more money to support those losses. Thus, before undertaking any transaction with these instruments, investors should be aware of their operation, as well as the rights, liabilities and risks implied by the same and the underlying securities. Investors should also be aware that secondary markets for the said instruments may not exist. Before entering into transactions in futures, derivatives, or options, investors should review all documents on disclosures for risks of investing in options and/or futures at the following websites:

Options - http://www.finra.org/Industry/Regulation/Notices/2013/P197741
Futures - http://www.finra.org/Investors/InvestmentChoices/P005912

BBVA or any of its affiliates’ salespeople, traders, and other professionals may provide oral or written market commentary or trading strategies to its clients that reflect opinions that are contrary to the opinions expressed herein. Furthermore, BBVA or any of its affiliates’ proprietary trading and investing businesses may make investment decisions that are inconsistent with the recommendations expressed herein. No part of this document may be (i) copied, photocopied or duplicated by any other form or means; (ii) reduplicated or (iii) quoted, without the prior written consent of BBVA. No part of this report may be copied, conveyed, distributed or furnished to any person or entity in any country (or persons or entities in the same) in which its distribution is prohibited by law. More specifically, this document is in no way intended for, or to be distributed or used by an entity or person resident or located in a jurisdiction in which the said circumstances do not apply to the individual who is accessing the document contravene any local laws which requires BBVA or any of its affiliates to obtain a licence or be registered. Failure to comply with these restrictions may breach the laws of the relevant jurisdiction.

The remuneration system concerning the analysts responsible for the preparation of this report is based on multiple criteria, including the revenues obtained by BBVA and, indirectly, the results of BBVA Group in the fiscal year, which, in turn, include the results generated by the investment banking business; nevertheless, they do not receive any remuneration based on revenues from any specific transaction in investment banking.

In the United Kingdom, this document is directed only at persons who (i) have professional experience in matters relating to investments falling within article 19(5) of the financial services and markets act 2000 (financial promotion order 2005 (as amended, the “financial promotion order”)), (ii) are persons falling within article 49(2) (a) to (d) (“high net worth companies, unincorporated associations, etc.”) of the financial promotion order, or (iii) are persons to whom an invitation or inducement to engage in investment activity (within the meaning of section 21 of the Financial Services and Markets Act 2000) may otherwise lawfully be communicated (all such persons together being referred to as “relevant persons”). This document is directed only at relevant persons and must not be acted on or relied on by persons who are not relevant persons. Any investment or investment activity to which this document relates is available only to relevant persons and will be engaged in only with relevant persons.

BBVA Hong Kong Branch (CE number AFR194) is regulated by the Hong Kong Monetary Authority and the Securities and Futures Commission of Hong Kong. In Hong Kong, this report is for distribution only to professional investors within the meaning of Schedule 1 to the Securities and Futures Ordinance (Cap 571) of Hong Kong. This document is distributed in Singapore by BBVA’s office in this country for general information purposes and it is generally accessible. In this respect, this document does not take into account the specific investment goals, the financial situation or the need of any particular person and it is exempted from Regulation 34 of the Financial Advisors Regulation (“FAR”) (as required in Section 27 of the Financial Advisors Act (Chapter 110) of Singapore (“FAA”)).

Garanti Securities headquarters is in Istanbul, Turkey and is regulated by Capital Markets Board (Sermaye Piyasasasi Kurulu - SPK, www.spk.gov.tr). BBVA, BBVA Bancomer, BBVA Chile S.A., BBVA Colombia S.A., BBVA Continental, BBVA Securities and Garanti Securities are not authorised deposit institutions in accordance with the definition of the Australian Banking Act of 1959 nor are they regulated by the Australian Prudential Regulatory Authority (APRA).

General Disclaimer for Readers Accessing the Report through the Internet

Internet Access

In the event that this document has been accessed via the internet or via any other electronic means which allows its contents to be viewed, the following information should be read carefully: The information contained in this document should be taken only as a general guide on matters that may be of interest. The application and impact of laws may vary substantially depending on specific circumstances. BBVA does not guarantee that this report and/or its contents published on the Internet are appropriate for use in all geographic areas, or that the financial instruments, securities, products or services referred to in it are available or appropriate for sale or use in all jurisdictions or for all investors or counterparties. Recipients of this report who access it through the Internet do so on their own initiative and are responsible for compliance with local regulations applicable to them. Changes in regulations and the risks inherent in investments may affect the information contained in the site. Consequently, the information contained in the site is supplied on the understanding that the authors and editors do not hereby intend to supply any form of consulting, legal, accounting or other advice. All images and texts are the property of BBVA and may not be downloaded from the Internet, copied, distributed, stored, re-used, re-transmitted, modified or used in any way, except as specified in this document, without the express written consent of BBVA. BBVA reserves all intellectual property rights to the fullest extent of the law.